Inclusive Journalism on Disability News in TribunSumsel.com during Covid 19 Pandemic Era

Rindang Senja Andarini

Universitas Sriwijaya, Palembang, Indonesia E-mail: rindangsenjaandarini@fisip.unsri.ac.id

Abstract. Reports in the mass and online media tend to present people with disabilities in an insufficient representation. When people with disabilities are portrayed in the news, they are often marked by the stigma attached by society. This shows the importance of directing the approach of journalists toward inclusive journalism. This research aims to examine how the representation of different abilities is portrayed in the local online media TribunSumsel.com. This research uses the framing analysis method of Zhongdang Pan and Gerald M. Kosicki. The results of the research show that many news of TribunSumsel.com presented a positive portrayal of people with different ability by avoiding the use of stereotypical language or phrases. However, in terms of news sources, this media more often used non-disabled sources, even in disability news. In other topics, people with disabilities were not involved as news sources. The use of images was still focused on people with physical disabilities, while other disabilities were not raised. In addition, the portrayal of people with different abilities as inspiring objects still stood out (inspiration porn). This result showed that the media still needs to apply the principles of inclusive journalism.

Keywords: Inclusive, media, representation, disabled, disability

Article Info:

Received 09 August 2022, Revised 24 Dec 2022, Accepted 26 Dec 2022, Available online 30 Dec 2022

INTRODUCTION

In a diverse society, the mass media should provide equal access and opportunities to all groups of people, as well as to create a more inclusive environment. The problem is that the mass media tends to represent marginal groups in very small portions (underrepresented) and tends to be misrepresented. Marginalized groups that are often misrepresented are people with diffability, women, children, minority religious or belief groups, and minority cultural groups. According to the Inclusive Media Index (IMI), the four most vulnerable marginal groups experiencing problems of representation are women in violence, people with disabilities, gender and sexual diversity people, and religious communities (Thaniago, 2020; Watie, 2010).

People with different abilities

(diffable people) are a marginal group whose presence in the mass media is very underrepresented. Diffable people appear in a small percentage and is framed with clichéd and stereotyped depictions (Tuneva, 2011). Diffable portraits on television shows, based on Paul Hunt (1991) cannot be separated from the stereotype of a person who should be pitied, an object of curiosity or violence, a cruel person, a cripple, the center of attention, an object to be laughed at, an enemy, a burden to others, non-sexual people, and people who find it difficult to get involved with society (Pirls & Popovska, 2013). Representation of people with different abilities on TV entertainment programs still seems problematic. The percentage of appearances with disabilities tend to be very low and is portrayed negatively as tragic, pitiable objects, pathetic, evil,

ridiculed burdens, and God's punishment for sin (Alenaizi & Alshammari, 2021; Saito & Ishiyama, 2005).

Stereotypical depictions of different abilities also feature prominently in the news media. News narratives, when raising disability issues, tend to be pessimistic in tone, emphasizing stereotypes of objects of pity, and sharpening prejudice against disabilities (Gilbert et al., 1997; Green & Tanner, 2009; Haller et al., 2006; Ye & Zeldes, 2020). National newspapers in Indonesia more often appear with different abilities in the description of poor people. who need financial assistance, miserable and almost all of their articles are more focused on disability, not the individuality (Anton, 2016). Dramatization of people with different abilities in the news is usually carried out by emphasizing the narration of sad stories, sensational news frames, and the objectification of people with different abilities through clichéd sentences (Kurnia, Wendratama, Monggilo, Utomo, & Rahayu, 2021). Besides, the representation of people with different abilities in the mass media influences people's perceptions of disabilities and their perceptions of themselves. Negative depictions of people with different abilities can undermine their self-identity, positive depictions encourage public awareness of the issue of discrimination and lead to positive emotions (Farnall & Smith, 1999; von Sikorski & Schierl, 2012; Zhang & Haller, 2013).

As the latest mass, the online media is believed to be the most effective news distribution in reaching a wide audience (Mahyudin, 2019). It needs to adopt a collaborative and inclusive approach. Inclusive journalism is a set of normative discourses, editorial policies, and reporting practices that have arisen and been developed to provide a diversity of voices in the media domain (Rupar, 2017). The objective of inclusive

journalism is to develop an inclusive communicative competence to enable reflective thinking, the experience of social, political, and cultural pluralism, and recognition of otherness towards the process of constructing identities (Rupar & Pesic, 2012).

The Covid-19 pandemic has had impacts on health, economic, social, political, and cultural at all levels of society. In the pandemic, based on the data uploaded by the Diffable Persons Organization (DPO) Network, people with different abilities experienced difficulties accessing health information and services (Kurnia, Wendratama, Monggilo, Utomo, & Rahayu, 2021). In addition, in restrictions on physical interaction, people with disabilities still receive discriminatory treatment in the fields of education, economy, and protection. This fact raises the question of whether the media through the disseminated news has played a role in creating a more just and inclusive environment for people with disabilities. This research seeks to reveal how inclusive journalism is applied to the national online media Tribunnews. com from April 1, 2021, to April 1, 2022, which was the period when the Covid-19 pandemic took place. The selection of objects is based on the results of the 2020 inclusive media index (IMI) survey related to the reporting on marginalized groups in Indonesia which shows that Tribunnews.com is in the final ranking below nine other national online media (Thaniago, 2020).

METHOD

This research uses a qualitative approach and framing analysis as the analytical technique. Media framing is a process in which stories are arranged through a pattern of selection, emphasis, interpretation, and exclusion. (Caragee & Roefs, 2004), in which journalists frame an issue by highlighting certain aspects

of social or political reality (Entman, 1993). Media framing needs to be studied considering that the media has the power to shape government decisions or policies through its ability to represent and direct social attention to an issue in certain ways (Lancaster et al., 2011) related to the choice of which reality is included and excluded, the choice of news sources and language (Eriyanto, 2005). The framing analysis model used in this research is the Pan and Kosicki model which analyzes four framing devices, such as syntactic structure, script, thematic, and rhetorical. The unit of analysis studied is news on Tribunnews.com which reported the issue of disability and/or news featuring people with different abilities as a news subject during the period April 1, 2021, to April 1, 2022.

To maintain the validity of this research, the researcher must meet the criteria of trustworthiness and authenticity as a substitute for internal and external validity which are commonly used in the positivism paradigm (Denzin & Lincoln, 2018). Trustworthiness in this research is carried out in several ways, including 1) Increasing high credibility by triangulating sources and methods, and 2) Transferability through a debriefing with colleagues (Denzin & Lincoln, 2018).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In this section, an analysis was carried out on each element of news framing (syntax, script, thematic, and rhetorical) and then examined the concepts and principles of an inclusive journalism. The researcher used news inclusiveness points to reveal the tendency of disabled frames to refer to indicators in the inclusive media index (Thaniago, 2020) which included two aspects. The first was journalism standards (availability of news sources, balance, media ethics in protecting privacy, media ethics related to sensationalism, media ethics related to

clickbait titles, and media ethics related to marking) and the second aspect was media affirmation (items monitored are the composition of sources, tone of sources, and scale of reporting). From June 1, 2021, to June 30, 2022, there were at least fourteen news reports regarding disabilities and people with different abilities which are described in table 1.

Syntactic Structure

Analysis of the syntactic structure consists of headlines, leads, background information, source citations, statements, and closing. By analyzing the syntactic structure, the researcher would be able to reveal how journalists arrange news facts and schemes (Eriyanto, 2005). The selection of sources and presentation of excerpts of statements, both in terms of the length of the quotations and tone of the emphasis, need to be scrutinized because it shows the attitude of the media towards an issue. Research by Yuniati and Fardiah (2017), regarding the framing of the image of female legislative candidates, shows that the media has not fully provided balanced and equal access for women, as can be seen from the tendency of the media to position women as a source of observation, not the main source

As shown in Table 1, the lead in the June 4, 2021 edition of the news emphasized information regarding the visit of President Jokowi's special staff. The news background contained regarding information the message (agenda) to be conveyed, namely: prioritize Covid-19 a request to vaccinations for people with different abilities and health recovery. The sources cited in this news were the Presidential Special Staff, Angkie Yudistia, and the Mayor of Solo, Gibran Rakabuming Raka. At the end of the news, the Mayor of Solo claimed the commitment of the Solo City Government to provide support

TABLE 1. Different ability and disability reporting frames on Tribunnews.com

Edition	Title	News Framing
June 4, 2021	bran Minta Penyandang Disabilitas Dapat Prioritas Vaksin'' (Jokowi's Special Staff Meet with Gibran and	Syntax: The lead and background information emphasized the Mayor of Solo's commitment to prioritizing the vaccination for diffable people and the image of a diffable-friendly City of Solo. News sources: official government sources. Script: 5 W + 1 H. Thematic:
	Writer: Wahyu Gilang Putranto Editor: Garudea Prabawati	- The central government asked local governments to prioritize people with different abilities in the vaccination program.
		-Mayor of Solo's commitment to support people with disabilities.
		Rhetorical: Used the term "people with disabilities" and other terms that were neutral and did not demean/weaken people with different abilities, did not include photos of people with different abilities but photos of public officials.
August 21, 2021	Pemilu 2019 Sosialisasi Bagi Penyandang Disabil- itas Tak Maksimal" (The National Commission on Human Rights States that	Syntax: The lead and background information emphasized the problem of data collection and dissemination of election administration for people with disabilities. News source: only official sources, the Head of the Election Team of the National Human Rights Commission, Hairiansyah.
	with disabilities was not optimal.) Writer: Danang Triatmojo Editor: Dewi Agustina	Script: The reporting focused on explaining the problem of data collection and socialization of the 2019 elections (what) and the reasons for elections not being optimal for people with disabilities who wanted to vote (why).
		Thematic:
		- Data collection and socialization of the implementation of the 2019 elections were not maximized.
		- The National Human Rights Commission called for the 2024 Election to accommodate people

with disabilities.

Rhetoric: using the term "people with disabilities" and other neutral terms, not displaying photos of people with different abilities but photos of public officials, the Head of the Election Team of the National Commission on Human Rights.

September 2021

16, "Presiden Jokowi Vaccination Center for People with Disabilities)

Tinjau Syntax: The lead and background infor-Grab Vaccine Center Yo- mation emphasized what (Grab estabgyakarta, Pusat Vaksinasi lished Grab Vaccine Center Yogyakarta Ramah Penyandang Dis- to support the national vaccination proabilitas" (President Jokowi gram). News sources: only citing offi-Visits Yogyakarta's Grab cial parties, namely Grab Indonesia and Vaccine Center, Friendly Good Doctor Technology Indonesia

> Script: Focusing on what (explains the Grab and Good Doctor collaboration program to support vaccination).

Thematic:

- Grab and Good Doctor was collaborating to support the Covid-19 vaccination

Rhetoric: Using neutral terms, it did not display photos of people with disabilities but photos of the President of the Republic of Indonesia, Joko Widodo.

September 2021

Not Diffable)

Writer: Abdul Majid

Editor: Toni Bramantoro

17, "Senny Marbun: Pak Joko- Syntax: The lead and background inwi Berani Menyetarakan formation emphasized appreciation for Harkat dan Martabat Kita Indonesian President Joko Widodo for Dengan Yang Nondifabel" his full support for athletes with differ-(Senny Marbun: Mr. Jokowi ent abilities. News source: Chairperson Equalizes Our Dignity and of the Indonesian National Paralympic Worth with Those Who Are Committee (NPC) Senny Marbun, athletes with different abilities. Zainudin Amali (Minister of Youth and Sports).

> **Script**: Appreciation to the President and Minister of Youth and Sports for the attention and support for athletes with different abilities (what), people who felt they had equal support (who), and how the government supported them (how).

Thematic:

- Appreciation from the Chairman of the NPC to the President and Minister of Youth and Sports for equal support for athletes with different ability

Rhetoric: The sentence emphasized equality "all athletes are equal, both those with disabilities and those without different abilities "

Showing photos of athletes from the 2020 Tokyo Paralympics.

October 5, 2021

Hak Penyandang Disabilitas di Pemilu" (Bawaslu RI Reveals a Number of Issues of Fulfilling the Rights of People with Disabilities in Elections)

Writer: Danang Triatmojo Editor: Johnson Simanjuntak

"Bawaslu RI Beberkan Se- Syntax: The lead and background inforjumlah Masalah Pemenuhan mation emphasizes the difficulty of fulfilling the right to vote for people with disabilities. News source: Chairman of the Election Supervisory Agency of the Republic of Indonesia

> **Script:** The right to vote for people with different abilities was difficult to be fulfilled (what), various problems caused difficulties in fulfilling the right to vote for people with disability, including the incompatibility of the identity card address with their domiciles and problems with Pooling accessibility (why).

Thematic:

- Obstacles in fulfilling the rights of people with disabilities in elections.

Rhetoric: Neutral sentences (no sentences that stereotyped people with different abilities as burdens or stereotyped lianas), featuring a photo of Abhan as the Chairman of the Republic of Indonesia's Election Supervisory Board (Bawaslu)

October 6, 2021

"Diasuh di Rumah Kasih Sayang, Remaja Difabel Ini Justru Mendapat Kekerasan dari Orangtua Asuh" (Raised at the Rumah Kasih Sayang, This Diffable Teenager in fact Receives Violence from the Foster Parents)

Editor: Erik S

Syntax: Leads and background information revealed the reason why the victim's mother sent her child to Rumah Kasih Sayang (RKS) and information on the victim's initials and age. The source cited was the Head of the PPA Satreskrim Sleman Police, Iptu Yunanto Kukuh. There were no excerpts from the interview with the victim's family.

Script: Incidents of persecution of adolescents with different abilities and threats of punishment against perpetrators (what), initials of perpetrators and victims (who), when the abuse occurred (when), the chronology of the persecution (how), the motives behind the persecution (why).

Thematic:

- Chronology of abuse of adolescents with different abilities.
- Motives of the perpetrators of the persecution.
- Threats of punishment from the perpetrators of abuse.

Rhetoric: No stereotypes, featuring illustrations of violence against children.

October 2021

27. "BPJamsostek Gandeng Tenaga Kerja Difabel, Posisi Ini Disiapkan" sition Is Prepared)

> Writer: Arief Basuki Rohekan

Editor: Vanda Rosetiati

Sumbagsel Syntax: Leads and background information revealed the commitment of The Workers Social Security Agency to pro-(BPJAMSOSTEK Southern vide equal rights and employment oppor-Sumatra Collaborates with tunities for people with disabilities. The Diffable Workers, This Po-source cited was the Deputy Director of The Workers Social Security Agency for the South Sumatra Region, Surva Rizal.

> Script: The Workers Social Security Agency's efforts to create job opportunities for people with disabilities (what), the reason why the company needs to open access to job opportunities for people with disabilities (why), how is the process of recruiting employees with disabilities at The Workers Social Security Agency of Sumbagsel (how).

Thematic:

- The Workers Social Security Agency for the South Sumatra Region provides job opportunities for people with disabilities

Rhetoric: There was no stereotype, showing a photo of signing a contract for an employee with disabilities as an intern at The Workers Social Security Agency Palembang. Often using the term "People with disabilities".

November 2021

6, "Senny Marbun Puji Pres-Disabilities)

Syntax: Leads and background inforiden dan Menpora Amali mation provided information regard-Terkait Kesetaraan Atlet ing the implementation of the National Disabilitas" (Senny Marbun Paralympic Week (Peparnas) XVI Papua Praises the President and 2021. The source of the citation was only Menpora Amali regarding the Chairman of the Indonesian Nation-Equality for Athletes with al Paralympic Committee (NPC), Senny Marbun, there were no excerpts from

Writer: Abdul Majid

tom

interviews with athletes with disabilities Editor: Hasiolan Eko P Gul- who advanced in Peparnas XVI Papua 2021

> **Script:** appreciation from the chairman of the NPC Indonesia for the support of the President and Minister of Youth and Sports in preparing Peparnas XVI Papua 2021, an equal form of support for all athletes, sports competed in, and the number of athletes competing (what).

Thematic:

- Praise to President Joko Widodo and the Minister of Youth and Sports for their support for athletes with disabilities

Rhetoric: There was a dichotomy between "normal athletes" and "athletes with different abilities", the captions and photos were the same as in the September 17, 2021 edition of the news, although the events and topics raised were different.

December 2021

"Presiden Jokowi Lantik 7 Their Biographies)

Writer: Fransiskus Adhivuda Prasetia

Editor: Johnson Simanjuntak

Syntax: The lead and background in-Anggota Komisi Nasion- formation consisted of an explanation al Disabilitas, Berikut So- regarding the inauguration of the Nasoknya" (President Jokowi tional Commission on Disabilities for Inducts Seven Members to the 2021-2026 period. This news did not the National Commission include sources of interview excerpts. on Disabilities; These Are This news did not comprehensively explain disability issues, vision, mission, and how the National Commission on Disabilities worked. The quotations included in the news were excerpts from the oath of office of the management.

> **Script:** The inauguration of the National Commission on Disabilities for the 2021-2026 period (what), the people appointed as administrators (who), and the place or location of the inauguration (where).

Thematic:

- Seven members of the National Commission on Disabilities for the 2021-2026 period

Rhetoric: No stereotypes. The photo shown was a photo of President Joko Widodo inaugurating members of the National Commission on Disabilities.

December 2021

December 3, and Social Me-still need to be highlighted. dia Use and Sharing)

Writer: Devi Rahma Syafira

Editor: Miftah

"Twibbon Hari Disabilitas Syntax: The lead and background infor-Internasional 3 Desember mation contained an explanation of the serta Cara Menggunakan twibbon link to commemorate the Interdan Bagikan ke Media So- national Day of Disabilities. There were sial" (Twibbon on Interna- no quotes from sources and no in-depth tional Day of Disabilities, information about disability issues that

> Script: A collection of twibbons to commemorate International Disability Day (what), when was the commemoration (when), and how did the commemoration carried out by the Association of Indonesian Medical Rehabilitation Specialists Branch Central Java and Yogyakarta (PERDOSRI) with the Anne Avantie Foundation (how).

Thematic:

- Links and how to use Twibbon to celebrate International Day of Disabilities (Hari Disabilitas Internasional/HDI).
- HDI Anniversary essence.

Rhetoric: There were no stereotypes, several photos were displayed, namely images showing wheelchair users and physical disabilities accompanied by the words "International Day of Disabilities: December 3, 2021" and a photo of a doctor guiding a person with different abilities while walking using a walker. Often using the term "people with disabilities".

December 2021

the 2024 Election)

13, "Gerindra Undang 21 Or- Syntax: The lead and background inforganisasi Penyandang Dis- mation contained an explanation regardabilitas Bahas Pemenuhan ing the discussion of political rights for Hak Politik Pemilu 2024" people with different abilities in the 2024 (Gerindra Invites 21 Or- election. There was only one source of ganizations of People with the quotation, namely the Deputy Head Disabilities to Discuss Po- for People's Welfare and Social Affairs litical Rights Fulfillment in for the Gerindra Party, Dr. Sumarjati Arioso.

Writer: Taufik Ismail

Editor: Adi Suhendi

Script: Webinar activity discussing the efforts of the Gerindra Party to fulfill the political rights of people with different abilities in the 2024 Election, the purpose of forming the National Commission on Disabilities (Komisi Nasional Disabilitas/ KND).

Thematic:

- The Gerindra Party encouraged the fulfillment of the political rights of people with disabilities in the 2024 election.

Rhetoric: There was no stereotype, a photo of the Deputy for People's Welfare and Social Affairs of the Gerindra Party, Dr. Sumarjati Arjoso, was shown.

March 27, 2022

"Kaum Difabel Ambil Bakowi's Commitment)

Writer: Fransiskus Adhivuda Prasetia

Editor: Dewi Agustina

Syntax: The lead and background inforgian di Banteng ride and mation consisted of excerpts from the Night Run 2022, Hasto: statement of the Secretary General of the Sejalan dengan Komitmen PDIP DPP, Hasto Kristiyanti, regarding Jokowi" (Diffable Group PDIP's commitment to support people Participates in the Banteng with different abilities. The source of Ride and Night Run 2022, the quote is the Secretary General of the Hasto: Aligned with the Jo- PDIP DPP, Hasto Kristiyanto, as well as Ristan and Saldi. The last two people are persons with disabilities who were involved as the committee members.

> **Script:** PDIP invited people with disabilities to take part in the Banteng Ride and Night Run event (what), the place and time of the event (where and when), disabled persons involved as event organizers (who), how the accident that caused Ristan to become people with different abilities (how).

Thematic:

- PDIP was committed to promote equality for people with different abilities by involving them in various events held by PDIP.

Rhetoric: There was a stereotypical sentence (disabilities were objects of mercy), showing photos of Ristan and Aldi (people with different abilities who were involved as committee members) with the caption "People with Different Ability Take Part in the Banteng Ride and Night Run 2022 Event"

April 23, 2022

Berhasil Raih Penghargaan" Inclusive Work Environment, This Nation's Company Wins Awards)

Writer: Nurfina Fitri Melina Editor: Firda Fitri Yanda

"Hadirkan Lingkungan Ker- Syntax: The lead and background inforja Beragam dan Inklusi, Pe- mation contained an explanation of the rusahaan Anak Bangsa Ini importance of diversity and inclusion in the work environment. The source inter-(Presenting a Diverse and view excerpts were only from official sources, Gojek

> Script: emphasizing why diversity and inclusion were important for companies (why), PT GoTo Gojek Tokopedia Tbk (Goto) had programs and policies to promote an inclusive work environment, such as the NakaParents and NakaDifabel programs (what), how to form inclusive programs and policies at GoTo (how).

Thematic:

- The importance of diversity and inclusion in the work environment

Rhetoric: None of the sentences consisted of stereotypes. This news showed illustrative photos of the company's atmosphere and photos of the atmosphere at the Gojek office. The lexicon used emphasized inclusion.

June 11, 2022

Persis Solo Versus PSS Sleman di Barisan Terdepan" (Friendly Stadium Manahan, Athletes with Disabilities Watch Persis Solo Versus PSS Sleman at the forefront) Writer: Muhammad Nursina Rasyidin

Editor: Claudia Noventa

"Ramahnya Stadion Mana- Syntax: The lead and background inforhan, Atlet Difabel Nonton mation consisted of an explanation about Manahan Stadium, Solo, which has disabled-friendly facilities. The source of interview excerpts was only Media Officer Persis Solo, Bryan Barcelona

> Script: emphasizing the friendliness of the Manahan Stadium facilities for people with different abilities (what)

Thematic:

- Manahan Solo Stadium became the venue for the opening match of the President's Cup.
- Manahan Solo Stadium had facilities for people with different abilities

Rhetoric: Sentences tended to be neutral and did not contain stereotypes. This news presented two photos, a photo when athletes with different abilities watched the opening match of the

President's Cup and a photo of the entrance to the Manahan stadium gate which was easily accessible for people with different abilities. The lexicon used was neutral (using the phrases "disabled", "athlete with disabilities", and "athletes with different abilities" which had a positive connotation.

for people with different abilities. At the same time, there was also a claim of Solo City as a disabled-friendly city.

"Solo once hosted the Paralympics Tournament in 2011 and the event was attended by eleven countries." "Services for people with disabilities in Solo are also thorough, such as the existence of a hospital and the NPC (National Paralympic Committee of Indonesia) in Solo," he said. (Concluding citation from Tribunnews.com news June 4, 2021)

The August 21, 2021 edition of the news on the lead elements and background information emphasized the issue of data collection and socialization of the holding of elections for members of the disabled community. Only one source was cited, namely Hariansyah, the Head of the Election Team of the National Human Rights Commission. The perspectives of members of the diffable community, regarding the constraints they experienced when channeling their right to vote during elections, were not included. On September 16, 2021, the edition of the news had a more advertorial pattern in which the main focus of the news was not on disability issues but on the positive image of Grab and Good Doctor. This news only cited Grab and Good Doctor, while people with different abilities who were the target of the program, were not cited.

The March 27, 2022 edition of the news pointed to inconsistencies

between titles, leads, and emphasis on facts. The title of this news was "Kaum Difabel Ambil Bagian di Banteng Ride and Night Run 2022, Hasto: Sejalan dengan Komitmen Jokowi" (People with Disabilities Take Part in the Banteng Ride and Night Run 2022, Hasto: Aligned with the Jokowi's Commitment), but the lead did not disclose the progress of the disabled people in the event. It can be seen from the leads and background information that the emphasized fact here is the image of the PDIP.

The Secretariat General of the PDIP DPP, Hasto Kristiyanto, stated that his party was aligned with the President Jokowi's commitment to people with different abilities.

PDIP is always committed to motivating all people with different abilities. (March 27, 2022 issue of the news lead)

This news was made longer than other news and it was made continuous. Inserted in the middle, there was the life story of Ristan who had an accident as a teenager which made it difficult for him to walk. In the closing section, there was an emphasis on the image of the Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle (Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan or PDIP) as a party that cares for people with different abilities. They appreciated PDIP's initiative to involve people with different abilities because Ristan remembered that so far political parties had not paid attention to people with disabilities.

"Luckily this time we were involved by PDIP. We hope that there will be more activities involving people with disabilities," said Ristan. (Closing of the March 27, 2022 news edition)

The news provided a longer story regarding the contribution of PDIP which also paid attention to disability issues. Even so, in substance, this news did not comprehensively discuss the root causes of inequality in the world of work experienced by people with disabilities. Based on PDIP, in another news item entitled "Gerindra Invites 21 Organizations of People with Disabilities to Discuss Political Rights Fulfillment in the 2024 Election", Tribunnews.com also showed the same style of news. It was more inclined to report on the positive image of the party, not the substance of disability issues.

When viewed from the selection of news sources, most of the news on *Tribunnews.com* preferred official sources (especially government institutions and public officials) rather than individuals with disabilities. The dominance of the selection of official sources also usually occurred in news with general topics. Based on Brown et al (1987), people who can speak in the news depend on reliability, believability, authority, and articulation, while the easiest way to find people who meet these criteria is to look for official sources within institutions. Tuchman (1973) also stated that reporters depend on bureaucratic (government) sources because bureaucrats produce facts that are assumed to be true and free from public interest.

Based on the guidelines for inclusive media coverage, the media should broaden their sources by involving people with different abilities as news sources. Journalists should provide opportunities for people with different

abilities to speak from the perspective of people with disabilities collectively and involve people with disabilities in interviews on topics that are not related to their disability (Tuneva, 2011). Meanwhile, the research findings (in table 1) showed that people with disabilities are only featured in news related to disability issues. Apart from disability issues (for example political, economic, cultural, and technological issues), people with different abilities are not presented as a source of news. The limited appearance of people with different abilities outside of disability issues can exacerbate the stigma against them (Tuneva, 2011). To eradicate negative stereotypes from society, the media must provide more space to discuss other topics following the competencies and professions mastered.

Script Structure

In the script structure, the researcher tried to reveal how journalists explained facts by looking at the completeness of the news (5 W + 1 H). Did the news contain all of the elements of the news which include what (event), who (who was involved), when (when the event happened), where (where the event took place), why (reasons why it happened), and how (how the event happened). Table 1 describes how the presentation of Tribunnews.com facts in each edition was studied. June 4, 2021 edition of the News emphasized what elements (meetings discussing vaccination priorities for people with disabilities), who (the Presidential Staff with the Mayor of Solo), how (efforts to vaccinate people with disabilities were continuing and the number was still in the hundreds). The August 21, 2021 edition of the news emphasized what elements (problems of data collection and socialization of election implementation) and why (the reasons why election implementation problems occurred). September 16, 2021 edition

of the News provides more information about the collaboration between Grab and Good Doctor to support national vaccination including information about the number of vaccine targets (what) and how it would be implemented (how). Some news showed the completeness of the journalistic elements 5 W (what, who, when, where, why) and 1 H (how), but some news only focused on what elements, such as the June 11, 2022 edition of the news entitled "Ramahnya Stadion Manahan, Atlet Difabel Nonton Persis Solo Versus PSS Sleman di Barisan Terdepan" (Friendly Stadium Manahan, Athletes with Disabilities Watch Persis Solo Versus PSS Sleman at the forefront). This is a piece of short news without indepth discussion on the problem of low accessibility of public spaces, especially stadiums for people with different abilities

Thematic Structure

In the thematic structure, the focus of the researcher was to reveal how journalists expressed facts through the prominence of certain themes. The elements that were examined in depth in this structure were coherence and propositions or sentences (Eriyanto, 2005, pp. 263). From the thematic descriptions that have been presented in table 1, it appears that the September 17 2021 edition of the news emphasizes the theme of the government's and the president's concern for people with disabilities. In the news in other editions. Tribunnews. com also seemed to focus more on the themes of aid programs from the central and regional governments, political parties, and corporates. September 16, 2021 edition of the news has the main theme of the collaboration of Grab and Good Doctor to support the Covid-19 vaccination. This edition of the news did not raise the theme of the health problems of people with disabilities in the

pandemic situation and their difficulties in accessing vaccines but instead focuses on the bigger theme, namely the contribution of Grab and Good Doctor for people with disabilities through vaccination. It also occurred in the March 27, 2022 news which emphasized the theme of the PDIP Party's concern for people with disabilities and the December 13, 2021 news which highlighted the role of Gerindra in highlighting disability issues. The news seemed to emphasize the values of sympathy and charity rather than highlighting the basic rights of people with disabilities, such as their rights to education and decent work.

The findings in this study are in line with the results of the study by Kulkarni et al (2017) which showed that disability news often displays the collective identity of people with different abilities as recipients of charitable activities (such as donations, technology distribution, and funding for health and education issues), assistance programs provided by the government and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), as well as corporate programs, such as corporate social responsibility (CSR) that targets people with different ability. The practice of news coverage that relies too much upon and emphasizes the government, professional associations, and other institutions can be seen as an "effort to perpetuate the status quo" because it legitimizes institutions with privileged access to the news which in turn gives them political and economic power (Johnson-Cartee, 2005). Another consequence is the reduced public attention to disability issues because the theme raised places more emphasis on the role of the government and private sector.

Rhetorical Structure

To uncover news frames, elements that need to be examined in rhetorical structures are lexicon, graphics (pictures or photos), and metaphors. Regarding the lexicon, tribunnews.com's news prefers the first-person method of mentioning a subject by identifying the person before the disability as an example of "people with a disability." (Rupar & Zhang, 2022). In this case, Tribunnews.com was more dominant in using the term "people with disabilities". Tribunnews. com in the June 4 2022 edition of the news and several other editions chose to use the term 'people with disabilities' which had a neutral connotation and did not demean people with disabilities. There was no use of terms that were substantially underestimated by society (such as, the terms 'disabled' and 'idiot'). The language used to describe disabilities and people with disabilities reflected perceptions about them. The language that weakened and tended to be negative (disabled language) usually appeared in everyday communication in society, among professionals, and among people with disabilities themselves, as well as in the news media. Research conducted by Auslander and Gold Nora (1999) showed that newspapers in Canada and Arabic use disability terminology that is more positive when reporting on people with disabilities, especially when reporting on children with disability, but when reporting on disabilities in the context of groups or organizations, the terminology used is more non-standardized due to the anonymity of the subject being reported.

The word chosen to describe the subject of the news can indicate the direction of the news, either showing the character positively or negatively. In Edelman's view (Eriyanto, 2005, pp. 165-166), words that appear in a news story do not describe reality but rather indicate who benefits or does not benefit from the news. Choosing a subject pronoun with a positive connotation indicates that the news is more favorable to the subject. Conversely, if the word chosen has a

negative connotation, then the news is unfavorable. The research carried out by Satriani (2018) showed how sbs.com's news has a slight bias through the choice of the word 'Islamic militarism' to refer to the perpetrators of crimes in the incident of clashes between the Indonesian police and detainees at the Brimob Kelapa Dua prison, Depok (Satriani, 2018). Online media abc.com.au and sbs.com show different news frames, abc.com. au focuses on victims, while sbs.com focuses more on perpetrators of incidents.

The June 4, 2021 edition of the News used a lexicon that had an equal meaning and did not undermine people with disabilities. This news preferred the terminology of people with disabilities. This news showed a photo of the President's Special Staff sitting with the Mayor of Solo and did not display any photos of people with disabilities or graphics relevant to disabilities. The next edition of the news also used the equivalent lexicon, but from a graphical point of view, this news did not represent people with disabilities because the photos displayed were official sources. The September 16, 2021 edition of the News did not write a lexicon with a negative connotation. From a graphical standpoint, the photos displayed did not involve people with disabilities but featured the president. This was the case with other news except for the news in the November 6, 2021 edition which displayed the normal and abnormal dichotomy that could be seen in the sentence "President Jokowi and Ministry of Youth and Sports Amali equalize normal athletes and athletes with disabilities." When identifying non-disabled people, journalists need to select the terms carefully because some might give the impression of degrading the position of disabled people to non-disabled ones. Journalists should avoid terms that emphasize normal and abnormal dichotomies. Terms that should

be avoided, include able-bodied, abled, of sound body, healthy, normal, and good. It is advisable to replace these terms with 'people without disabilities' or non-disabled people (Rupar & Zhang, 2022).

Journalists should stereotypical terms. People with different abilities have long criticized the broadcast media for their normative depiction of different abilities – featured dramatically in themes of 'tragedy'; People with different abilities are associated with horror, bitterness, and anger; depictions that focus on the inability to live a 'normal' life with disabilities (Ross, 1997). In the sphere of everyday life, people with disabilities often receive a bad stigma and are demeaned, while for the family, it is considered a disgrace that needs to be covered (Wicaksono, Suryandari, & Camelia, 2021). The representation of people with disabilities in conventional mass media (television) and online media should encourage society to create a more inclusive environment.

Representation of Physical Disabilities is More Dominant

Different from the previous Tribunnews.com news which did not show photos of people with disabilities, the September 17, 2021, and November 6, 2021 editions of the news featured photos of athletes with different abilities using wheelchairs (figure 1), the March 27, 2022 edition of the news showed photos of two athletes with different ability sitting as a standing guard for the Banteng Ride and Night Run 2022 event (figure 2). People with different abilities shown in this news were athletes with physical disabilities (must walk with assistive devices). Judging from the depiction based on the disability and disability in the media stated in the visualization guidelines (figure 2), it can be assessed that tribunnews.com, especially in this report, has fulfilled the following points: the focus of the photo



Figure 1. Photo News *Tribunnews*. *com* Edition September 17, 2021, and November 6, 2021



Figure 2. *Tribunnews.com* News Photo, March 27, 2022 Edition

was not on disability, positive depiction, not showing stereotypically, emphasizing positive messages, namely achievement and enthusiasm, neutral camera angles, depicting the life experiences of disabled people during their daily activities (e.g. work). However, in terms of inclusivity, *Tribunnews.com* has not fulfilled it because it was more focused on physical disabilities.

The media Tribunnews.com seemed to homogenize disability, the word 'diffable' or 'disability' appeared in the news as if it represented all people with disabilities. In reality, disability does not always bring different conditions and problems. The International Classification of Functioning, Disability, and Health (ICF) classifies disabilities into eight categories, namely mobility and physical impairments, spinal disabilities, brain iniuries. visual disabilities. hearing disabilities, cognitive learning disabilities, psychological disorders, and invisible disabilities (Langtree, 2017).

The discourse on disability that appeared in the media seemed homogeneous because the media did not discuss or present disability separately but instead grouped some disabilities into a single disability discourse (Englandkennedy, 2008). Discourse on disability that should be inclusive has instead become exclusive because it focuses on physical disabilities.

The use of graphics that represented disabilities even in news that raises disability issues on Tribunnews.com was limited. The depiction of disability suggested that disability issues were monolithic (disability problems only focused on physical disabilities). In fiction programs, such as popular dramas and news, wheelchair users were often used as icons of disabilities. They preferred to represent people with physical disabilities, especially wheelchair users, over other disabilities (e.g. intellectual disabilities). Tribunnews.com had the same tendency, which is to display people with physical disabilities as shown in Figure 2 and did not include descriptions of other disabilities. The limited depiction of diverse disabilities also occurred in the broadcast media in Arabic. Disabilities that were often raised by the media were intellectual, visual disabilities, and physical disabilities (Al-Zoubi & Al-Zoubi, 2022), whereas mental disabilities are rarely raised.

Depictions of disability that only focus on physical disabilities do not represent the actual reality in which social categories (such as, ethnicity, gender, class, and disability) create systems of discrimination that overlap and influence each other (Ford et al., 2020). Intersectionality has not been a major concern for journalists. Intersectionality is a term that emerged to describe the impact that intersections between several social category systems have on a person's life (Collins, 2015). To implement inclusive journalism, journalists should not portray

disability in a monolithic manner but instead emphasize diversity, inclusion, and intersectionality which allows each individual with disabilities to experience different conditions and challenges.

Inspiration porn

From all the news analyzed, it appears that *Tribunnews.com* mostly showed people with different abilities in the news regarding sporting achievements on the national and international levels. The news on September 17 2021 and November 6, 2021 editions featured athletes with different abilities who won the 2020 Paralympics in Tokyo. In the news in previous years, the researcher saw that this media was more dominant in bringing up people with different abilities in the news about the sporting achievements of athletes with disabilities. In 2018, a lot of news about athletes with disabilities emerged because it coincided with the holding of the 2018 ASIAN Para Games. Some of the news headlines included: September 7, 2018 news edition "Tim Indonesia Tetap Optimistis Hadapi Negara Lain yang Sudah Lebih Dulu Mengenal Olahraga Boccia" (The Indonesian Team Remains Optimistic in Facing Other Countries That Have Already Known Boccia Sports) and 16 September 2018 news edition "Jokowi Pastikan Bonus Atlet Peraih Medali di Asian Para Games 2018 Sama Dengan Atlet Asian Games" (Jokowi Ensures Bonuses for Medal-Winning Athletes at the 2018 Asian Para Games Are Equal to Asian Games Athletes). Depictions of people with disabilities as achievers, strong and inspiring have become mainstream depictions in the news media, entertainment programs on television, novels, and children's storybooks. If it is not shown dramatically, people with different abilities are shown as objects of inspiration and superhumans (supercrip). The media literacy for children in

Indonesia needs to be more intense in producing illustrated stories that instill values of equality between the disabled and non-disabled for children from an early age, and avoid sensitive sides, such as the use of terms that have derogatory connotations (Hafiar et al., 2017).

One of the principles for creating inclusive iournalism is avoiding inspiration porn in both text and images (Rupar & Zhang, 2022). The term inspiration porn was first raised by a comedian and activist Stella Young (2012) quoted in (Grue, 2016) "Inspiration porn is an image of a person with a disability, often a kid, doing something completely ordinary - like playing, or talking, or running, or drawing a picture, or hitting a tennis ball – carrying a caption like 'your excuse is invalid' or 'before you guit, try'." Jan Grue (2016) defined inspiration porn as an image/photo of a person with signs of limitations who visually appears to be doing physical activity and usually tends to display physical toughness, and then followed by captions that inspire the viewer (Grue, 2016).

The media tended to inspirational stories, especially stories from marginalized groups, including people with disabilities. The Black and White program in the episode 'Talk Show Athletes with Disabilities Achieved in Hitam Putih was full of inspiration porn: making athletes with disabilities as an object of inspiration, the achievements of athletes with disabilities are always associated with the need for money, not because of their right to participate, athletes with disabilities should be given more appreciation in competition due to their physical limitations, while, at the same time, athletes with disabilities are also positioned as objects of pity.

The media tends to sell inspirational stories, especially stories from marginalized groups, including people with disabilities. Hitam Putih's

program in the episode 'Talk Show Outstanding Diffable Athlete in Hitam Putih' was full of inspiration porn: making athletes with different abilities an object of inspiration, the achievements of athletes with disabilities are always associated with the need for money, not because of their right to participate, athletes with disabilities should be given more appreciation in competition due to their physical limitations, apart from that athletes with disabilities are also positioned as objects of pity (Setyowati, Watie, & Saptiyono, 2020)

They are not only stuck with inspirational porn, the media is often unconsciously stuck with the superscript depiction model when reporting on disability issues or people with different abilities, such as 'Meet the Superhumans,' which is an advertisement produced by Channel 4 which aims to campaign for the London 2012 Paralympics. The advertisement tried to change the negative construction of disabilities by depicting athletes with disabilities from various sports as 'superhuman' and 'extraordinary' figures. Disabled people are represented as non-disabled people who carry out various daily activities (eating, brushing their teeth, working, playing, going to school, and college, and driving to care for children). However, the highlighted representation is disabled as a superscript (Niyu, 2017). The ad 'We're the Superhumans' was criticized for displaying excessive expectations of people with disabilities. Supercript or supercripple is a term that refers to the exaggerated depiction of a disabled person as someone who has talents and abilities that even non-disabled people do not have (Schmiesing, 2014). The depiction of supercritical prominence in news narratives, advertisements, and fairy tales has been criticized because overly depictions of self-accomplishment can distract from the everyday realities

experienced by the majority of people with different abilities

CONCLUSION

This research aims to examine how people with different abilities are represented in the local online media TribunSumsel.com. This research discusses the representation of disability in the local online media, namely TribunSumsel.com. Studying the local online media in the study of disability will provide an overview of the condition of the disabled in the space closest to them because the local online media has the freedom to observe and listen, as well as to report on various perspectives on disabilities. In addition, the local online media has also become a medium for advocating their interests and also voicing the current situation and conditions of people with disabilities.

This research is intended to address the gaps in the study of the disability representation in Indonesia by using an inclusive journalism framework. This research found that although an inclusive journalism framework has been implemented in TribunSumsel.com, there are several important notes, especially concerning the minimal involvement of people with disabilities. The online media in this research does not take a disabilitycentered approach. Disabilities are often still seen as objects whose voices are silenced. Media portrayal plays a role in creating awareness towards different abilities groups, therefore greater awareness and understanding about different abilities in the local online media can contribute to public acceptance of the diversity of different abilities and also play a role in reducing stereotypes against them.

Communication skills and techniques are important for the success of an inclusive journalism. It can be conducted by involving people with

different abilities in media reporting. The implication is the need for education training regarding disabilities. especially from a social perspective. In the global discussion, certain countries have guidelines to support the media in reporting on people with disabilities in ways that are centered on them. In the Indonesian context, guidelines regarding the inclusion of people with disabilities in the online media already exist, but they have not received full support and guidance from the stakeholders. This research is limited to only examining the microstructure (produced media texts) to observe journalists' perspectives in reporting on disabilities and different abilities. For further research, my fellow researchers can use more in-depth and critical methods.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I express my gratitude to *Tribunnews.com* for providing the materials as the research data and to my colleagues at Sriwijaya University for their encouragement throughout this research.

REFERENCES

Adytya, B. (2021, Maret 22). Kisah pedih Janudin, nelayan difabel kaki tak sempurna, berjuang demi sesuap nasi. Merdeka. https://www.merdeka.com/trending/kisah-pedih-janudin-nelayan-difabel-kaki-tak-sempurna-berjuang-demi-sesuap-nasi.html, diakses tgl 30 Maret 2022

Alenaizi, H. M., & Alshammari, S. (2021). A Critical Content Analysis of Kuwaiti TV Shows and Plays on Disability Representations. *Arab Media & Society*, 31, 61-80.

Al-Zoubi, S.M, Al-Zoubi, S.M. (2022). The Portrayal of Persons with Disabilities in Arabic Drama: A Literature Review. Research in Developmental Disabilities, 125 (2022): 1-8.

- DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j. ridd.2022.104221
- Anton, T. (2016). Portrayals of People with Disabilities in Indonesian Newsprint Media (A Case Study on Three Indonesian Major Newspapers) . IJDS 3(1), 1 11.
- Auslander, G. K., & Gold Nora. (1999).

 Disability terminology in the media: a comparison of newspaper reports in Canada and Israel. Social Science & Medicine, 48, 1395–1405.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2018). The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research Fifth Edition. Los Angeles: SAGE Publications.
- Englandkennedy, E. (2008). Media Representations of Attention Deficit Disorder: Portrayals of Cultural Skepticism in Popular Media. Journal of Popular Culture, 41(1), 91-117
- Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. Journal of Communication, 43(4).
- Eriyanto. (2005). *Analisis Framing: Kontsruksi, Ideologi, dan Politik Media.* Yogyakarta: LKiS.
- Farnall, O., & Smith, K. A. (1999). Reactions to people with disabilities: Personal contact versus viewing of specific media portrayals. Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 76, 659–672.
- Ford, R., Gonzales, S., & Quade, V. (2020). Collaborative and Inclusive Journalism: More Than Words. Journalism & Mass Communication Educator, 75(1), 58–63
- Gilbert, A., MacCauley, M. I., & Smale, B. J. (1997). Newspaper portrayal of persons with disabilities over a decade. Therapeutic Recreation Journal, 31, 108–120.
- Green, K., & Tanner, S. (2009). Reporting Disability. Research Online: Reporting Vulnerability, 19, 43–54.
- Grue, J. (2016). The problem with *inspiration* porn: a tentative definition and a

- provisional critique. Disability & Society, 31: 838 849.
- Hafiar, H., Dewi, R., & Puspitasari, L. (2017).

 Pengadaan Media Literasi melalui
 Cerita Bergambar. MediaTor 10(2),
 216-226.
- Haller, B., Dorries, B., & Rahn, J. (2006). Media labeling versus the US disability community identity: A study of shifting cultural language. Disability & Society, 21, 61–75.
- Johnson-Cartee, K. (2005). News narratives and news framing: Constructing political reality. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Kulkarni, M., Gopakumar, K. v, & Vijay, D. (2017). Institutional discourses and ascribed disability identities. *IIMB Management Review*, 29, 160–169.
- Kurnia, N., Wendratama, E., Monggilo, Z. M., Utomo, W. P., & Rahayu. (2021). Modul Jurnalisme Inklusif: Liputan Tentang Perempuan, Anak, dan Difabel Selama Pandemi. Yogyakarta: Departemen Ilmu Komunikasi Universitas Gadjah Mada.
- Lancaster, K., Hughes, C. E., Spicer, B., Matthew-Simmons, F., & Dillom, P. (2011). Illicit drugs and the media: Models of media effects for use in drug policy research. Drug and Alcohol Review, 30, 397–402.
- Langtree, I. (2017, January 29). Disability: Definition, types and models. Retrieved from
 - https://www.disabled-world.com/disability/ types/, diakses tgl 1 April 2022
- Mahyudin. (2019). Sosiologi Komunikasi Dinamika Relasi Sosial di Dalam Era Virtualitas. Makassar: Penerbit Shofia.
- Niyu. (2017). Representasi Disabilitas dalam Iklan "We're the Superhumans". INKLUSI: Journal of Disability Studies, 4 (1): 49-70.
- Pirls, D., & Popovska, S. (2013). Media Mediated Disability: *How* to Avoid Stereotypes. *International Journal of* Scientific Engineering and Research

- (IJSER) 1(4),, 42-45.
- Ross, Karen. (1997). But *Where's* Me in It? Disability, Broadcasting and the Audience. Media Culture Society, Vol. 19: 669-677
- Rupar, V., & Zhang, C. (2022). Inclusive Journalism. Media Diversity Institute.
- Rupar, V., & Pesic, M. (2012). Development of Journalism Education and Rebuilding Democracy. In Hamada, B. (ed) Rebuilding Egyptian Media for a Democratic Future [in Arabic]Cairo: Dar Alam al-Kuttub, pp 154-171
- Rupar, V., & Pesic, M. (2012). Development of Journalism Education and Rebuilding Democracy. In Hamada, B. (ed) Rebuilding Egyptian Media for a Democratic Future [in Arabic]Cairo: Dar Alam al-Kuttub, pp 154-171
- Saito, S., & Ishiyama, R. (2005). The invisible minority: under-representation of people with disabilities in prime-time TV dramas in Japan. *Disability & Society*, 20(4), 437-451.
- Satriani, A. (2018). Framing Analysis of News Article about Clashes between Police and Terrorist Prisoners in Indonesia Publishing by ABC.net.au and SBS.com. *MediaTor* 11(2), 248-255.
- Schmiesing, A. (2014). Disability, Deformity, and Disease in the Grimms' Fairy Tales.

 Michigan: Wayne State University Press
- Setyowati, R. M., Watie, E. D., & Saptiyono, A. (2020). Representation of Disability Achievements in Television Talk Show Programs. *Jurnal The Messenger*, 40-51.

- Thaniago, R. (2020). Indeks Media Inklusif 2020: Rapor Jurnalisme Daring dalam Pemberitaan Kelompok Marginal di Indonesia. Remotivi.
- Tuchman, G. (1973). Making news by doing work: Routinizing the unexpected. Journal of Sociology, 79, 110–131.
- Tuneva, M. (2011). *Diversity Reporting Handbook*. School of Journalism and Public Relations.
- Von Sikorski, C., & Schierl, T. (2012). Effects of news frames on recipients' information processing in disability sports communications. Journal of Media Psychology: Theories, Methods, and Applications, 24, 113–123.
- Watie, E. D. S. (2010). Representasi Wanita Dalam Media Massa Masa Kini. Jurnal The Messenger, 2(2), 1–10.
- Wicaksono, D., Suryandari, N., & Camelia, A. (2021). Stereotip Tentang Difabel: Sebuah Perspektif Komunikasi Lintas Budaya. *Interaksi*, 10(1), 33-43.
- Ye, W., & Zeldes, G. A. (2020). The Representation of People With Disabilities in an Official Newspaper in China: A Longitudinal Study of the People's Daily From 2003 to 2013. Journal of Disability Policy Studies, 31(1), 26–34.
- Yuniati, Y., & Fardiah, D. (2017). Citra Caleg Perempuan dalam "Framing" Media "Online". MediaTor, 10 (1), 75-86.
- Zhang, L., & Haller, B. (2013). Consuming image: How mass media impact the identity of people with disabilities. Communication Quarterly, 61, 319–334.