An Integrated Model of Customers’ Satisfaction and Loyalty: A Business Analysis of Banking Service

RACHMAD HIDAYAT, SABARUDIN AKHMAD
1,2 Industrial Engineering Department, University of Trunojoyo Madura, Indonesia
email: 1 rachmad.hidayat@trunojoyo.ac.id

Abstract. The purpose of this paper is to determine the relationships of service quality, bank’s image, customer value and product quality with customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Sample is the state-owned banks’ customers in four major cities in Indonesia. Data is analyzed by using the Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) method. Results lead to an integrated model of customers’ satisfaction and loyalty. It is concluded that customer value and quality of bank products do not significantly and directly affect customer loyalty, but do significantly affect customer loyalty mediated by customer satisfaction. Service quality and bank’s image directly and indirectly affects customers’ satisfaction and loyalty. Service quality and bank’s image have the strongest and most dominant effects on customer loyalty.

Keywords: Service quality, the bank’s image, product quality, customer loyalty

Introduction

Competition for bank customers in Indonesia is unavoidably fierce. With a growing number of banks and branch offices and diverse products offered, service quality remains effective for banks to retain their customers or gain new ones. Quality of service is critical in the banking business. Increasingly, banks compete for customer base by relying on service quality. In addition to offering a wide range of products, improvements in information technology and physical aspects of services, the non-physical aspects of services and all the aspects related to excellent services are intended to improve service quality. All of these are prepared to meet customers’ needs and ultimately expected to effectively raise public funds.

Services have to be endlessly delivered, as banks work on the principle of trust. Thus, value matters. The best value can make customers satisfied and, eventually, loyal (Roig et al., 2006). A bank with a perceived quality of services does not necessarily have loyal customers. However, it turns out that customer loyalty to services delivered by a bank is sometimes not necessarily in line with the bank’s service quality. Customers’ remaining interested in banks that offer ease of transaction leads to a fierce competition for third-party funds. Hence, maintaining customer loyalty constitutes the effective way to accumulate cheap funds.

A promotional strategy of luring prospective customers with attractive gifts remains the main strategy of banks to raise cheap, third-party funds. Products and services should be continuously improved and enriched. Customer loyalty faces different tests every year. High interest rates prove to be a double-edged sword for customer loyalty. A range of efforts have been made by banks to boost customer loyalty. Possessing a large loyal customer base constitutes an expectation of all banks. On the contrary, having a disloyal customer base is not expected.

The purpose of the present study is to determine the relationship among the study variables (service quality, bank’s image, customer value, product quality, customer satisfaction and customer loyalty). This study
is expected to provide more comprehensive results. Theoretically, there is an empirical justification that there is a suspected strong, causal relationship of service quality, bank’s image, customer value and product quality with customer satisfaction and customer loyalty either directly or mediated by customer satisfaction. In addition, theories of service marketing support the above justification. Therefore, testing of these theories in empirical situations should be supported.

Population of the present study is all the customers of state-owned banks in four major cities on the island of Java, namely Jakarta, Bandung, Semarang and Surabaya. Bank customers are selected only at the main branch offices since there were more banking problems than at the cash outlets or units. Total sample is 200 respondents, which is based on, first, the guideline of 100−200 respondents for sample size; second, the number of indicators used in all latent variables is to be multiplied by 5−10 (Ferdinand, 2000:44). In this article, 25 indicators are used; thus, the sample size is 125−250 respondents. Respondents are selected by using probability sampling technique with systematic random sampling technique. Every customer with saving account has an equal opportunity to be sampled. Samples are selected through a probability and certain systems in which samples are selected after starting with a random selection for the first and subsequent data with a certain interval. Complete results of SEM analysis are shown in Table 1.

### Effects of Service Quality on Customer Satisfaction

Service quality has a significant effect on customer satisfaction. The better the service quality delivered by the bank, the more the customers would be satisfied with the service quality. Quality services leading to customer satisfaction are able to identify customers so as to understand the levels of customer perceptions and expectations of service quality. Results also demonstrates that those theoretical and empirical studies that states and showes significant causal relationships between service quality and customer satisfaction can also be used to study the banking sector in Indonesia.

Quality service marked a nearby location, basic standard; timely, appropriate tariff and non-discriminatory services (Hardiansyah, 2012). Service quality is the level of satisfaction generated by a particular transaction between the bank and the customer; it is a psychological condition generated when emotional factors induce expectations and adapt to the experience of past consumption. Customer attitudes to products or services are relative in nature, while satisfaction is an emotional reaction to the experience of past consumption (Munari et al., 2013). Customers evaluate the quality of banking services based on their experiences during the interaction with the banks. Positive experiences will strengthen customer perception of service quality, which in turn affect customer satisfaction. Negative experiences lead to customers’ unpleasant behaviors or dissatisfaction with the services delivered. This is supported by Olaleke (2010) who stated that satisfaction is more exclusively influenced by service quality.

Service quality is the result of current evaluation and consumption experience and is expected to have a direct, positive effect on overall customer satisfaction (Ariff et al., 2013). Service quality is positively correlated with pleasant behavioral intention and negatively related with unpleasant behaviors (Harris and Ezeh, 2008). Service quality is an attitude determined by customers’

### Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influence between variables</th>
<th>Coef</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>P-value</th>
<th>Note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Service quality</td>
<td>Customer Satisfaction</td>
<td>0.311</td>
<td>0.075</td>
<td>3.063</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Image</td>
<td>Customer Satisfaction</td>
<td>0.319</td>
<td>0.109</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Value</td>
<td>Customer Satisfaction</td>
<td>0.223</td>
<td>0.106</td>
<td>2.293</td>
<td>0.022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Quality</td>
<td>Customer Satisfaction</td>
<td>0.227</td>
<td>0.072</td>
<td>2.405</td>
<td>0.016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service quality</td>
<td>Customer Loyalty</td>
<td>0.210</td>
<td>0.097</td>
<td>2.226</td>
<td>0.026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Image</td>
<td>Customer Loyalty</td>
<td>0.234</td>
<td>0.138</td>
<td>2.432</td>
<td>0.015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Value</td>
<td>Customer Loyalty</td>
<td>0.098</td>
<td>0.134</td>
<td>1.108</td>
<td>0.268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product Quality</td>
<td>Customer Loyalty</td>
<td>-0.006</td>
<td>0.094</td>
<td>-0.064</td>
<td>0.949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Satisfaction</td>
<td>Customer Loyalty</td>
<td>0.344</td>
<td>0.161</td>
<td>2.969</td>
<td>0.003</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
perception of service quality (Chang et al., 2009). There is a causal relationship between service quality and customer satisfaction (Moutinho and Smith, 2000). Service quality is considered good when it can meet or exceed customer expectations. Bei and Chian (2001) suggested that service quality affects customer satisfaction. The present study also supported Bedi (2010), which maintained that the level of customer satisfaction is influenced by service quality.

**Effects of Bank’s Image on Customer Satisfaction**

Bank image has a significant effect on customer satisfaction. An increasingly enhanced image of a bank can increase customer satisfaction. This result supported the theory that a good image of the company may also lead to satisfaction. In addition, this result was also consistent with the previous studies of Hidayat (2009), Salam et al. (2013), Siraprapra and Tocquer (2012), Kim and Lee (2010), Ishaq (2012), and Simarmata (2014) which stated that corporate image had a significant effect on customer satisfaction.

Kotler (2006) suggested that image building is important for the survival of an organization in the future. The findings of this study corroborated those of Simarmata (2014) who maintained that a bank's good image will make its customers satisfied. It was also consistent with those of Aydin and Özer (2005) and Nguyen and Leblanc (2001) who stated that a good corporate image will affect customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Customer satisfaction and loyalty are also influenced by the image of the company (Ishaq, 2014).

**Effects of Customer Value on Customer Satisfaction**

Customer value has a significant effect on customer satisfaction. The better the customer value delivered, the more the customers are satisfied with the product. Customer provides a good evaluation of customer value delivered by banks. Results of this study corroborated those of Simarmata (2014) who maintained that a bank's good image will make its customers satisfied. It was also consistent with those of Aydin and Özer (2005) and Nguyen and Leblanc (2001) who stated that a good corporate image will affect customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Customer satisfaction and loyalty are also influenced by the image of the company (Ishaq, 2014).

**Effect of Product Quality on Customer Satisfaction**

Product quality has a significant effect on customer satisfaction. Customers are the determinant/assessor of the quality of a product. Customers have various measures at their disposal to determine the quality of a banking product. But, the ultimate goal to be achieved by a banking product is the same: to satisfy customers. Simply put, the more satisfied a customer to consume a banking product, the more the quality of a banking product is. Customer satisfaction or dissatisfaction is determined by the agreement between customer expectation
and customer perception of the actual performance of the product. Customers will be satisfied when the bank is able to deliver quality products complying with customers’ wishes or expectations. In other words, customers will form expectations of the actual performance of a product. The expected performance is to be compared to the actual performance of a product (perception of the quality of the product). When the actual performance is greater than or equal to the expectations customer satisfaction will occur.

Results of this study are supported by Lai et al. (2009); Zineldin (2005) and Bei and Chian (2001). Satisfaction and dissatisfaction is a customer’s response to the evaluation of a perceived discrepancy between the previous satisfaction (expectations) and actual performance of the product after consumption (Lai et al., 2009). Satisfaction is more exclusively influenced by service quality, product quality, price, situational factors and human factors (Zineldin, 2005). As with service quality, a causal relationship between the quality of banking products and customer satisfaction is influenced by customer expectations of product quality. When the quality of the products exceeds customer expectations of quality banking products, the customer will be satisfied with the quality of a given product. On the contrary, when the quality of the product does not comply with customer expectations, customers will be unsatisfied. Product quality affects customer satisfaction. Customers consuming banking products provide value in proportion to the product’s ability to meet their needs. The value is associated with the benefits the customer will receive. The quality of banking products is achieved by ascertaining overall customer expectations and increasing product or service value in order to meet customer expectations (Bei and Chian, 2001).

Effects of Service Quality on Customer Loyalty

Service quality has a significant effect on customer loyalty. Generally, banks want to retain their customers as long as possible. Customer loyalty is based on a very positive attitude and is reflected in the consistent repeat purchases. Repeat purchase may be the result of market dominance by a bank that managed to make the bank’s services as the only ones available. Repeat purchases can be a continuous promotion in order to entice and lure customers to use banking services. In case of no market dominance and intensive promotion efforts, only the loyal customers are committed to re-purchase.

This study is supported by Fullerton and Taylor (2002); Moutinho and Smith (2000) and Gorondutse and Hilman (2014). There is a causal relationship of service quality and satisfaction with customer loyalty. Service quality has a significant effect on customer loyalty. Customer satisfaction has a significant effect in mediating the relationship between service quality and customer loyalty. Customer satisfaction significantly moderates the effects that occur between service quality and customer loyalty (Fullerton and Taylor (2002). Perceived quality of services has a direct effect on customer loyalty (Moutinho and Smith, 2000). Customers who do not experience service problems have a high degree of loyalty intentions and external response intentions and switch to another lowest product. Among those customers experiencing service problems, it was significantly demonstrated that customers whose problems have been solved satisfactorily had loyalty, intention to pay a higher rate, intention to switch to another product and lower external response than those customers whose problems have not been solved (Gorondutse and Hilman (2014).

This study contradicts those of Zafar et al., (2011) and Bei and Chian (2001). Service quality has a modest effect on repurchase compared with customer satisfaction. Thus, an increase in service quality will only increase customer satisfaction but will not be able to create loyal customers who make repeat purchase/consumption of the banking services offered (Zafar et al., 2011). Service quality has an indirect effect on customer loyalty mediated by customer satisfaction. There is no significant and direct relationship between service quality and customer loyalty. But, there is an indirect relationship mediated by customer satisfaction (Bei and Chian, 2001).

Effects of Bank’s Image on Customer Loyalty

Bank’s image has a significant effect on customer loyalty. Referring to an empirical study conducted by Hermawan Karta Jaya and Omar S. Anwar, there are several things that are capable of affecting customer loyalty: first, a good quality service; second, the development of banking products in
accordance with customers’ needs; third, the use of bank information technology; and fourth, a good image of the bank. These results were demonstrated by the present study. Simultaneously, image is found to have a significant effect on customer loyalty. Changes in the level of loyalty could be accounted for by the image of the state-owned banks as much as 31.20% and the remaining 68.80% was accounted by other variables.

A company with a good image will encourage consumers to purchase the products it offers, improve competitiveness, enhance employee morale and increase customer loyalty. Customers will look for and use of products and services with a good image, especially those high-risk products or services. Bank is a good example of a business that is heavily influenced by a positive or negative image formed. A bank with a bad image will be relatively difficult to obtain customers, while a bank with a good image will certainly be easier to obtain and retain customers (Kandampully and Hu, 2007).

These findings are also consistent with those of Aydin and Özer (2005) and Nguyen and Leblanc (2001), which showed that a good corporate image would affect customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Customers may diminish recommendations and positive referral given to others, may not increase their amount of savings and may not purchase other products. However, they are still willing to save money in their banks or not go to other banks. These results were consistent with those of Hart and Rosenberger (2004) and Wang (2010), which indicated a significant effect of corporate image on customer loyalty. Other researchers suggested that satisfaction and customer loyalty are also influenced by image (Ishaq, 2014). Image has an effect on loyalty and brand image is the antecedent of loyalty. Studies demonstrated that reputation had an effect on customer loyalty (Wang and Wu, 2012).

**Effects of Customer Value on Customer Loyalty**

Customer value has an insignificant effect on customer loyalty. Value is aimed at providing customers with benefits, both economically and in terms of service benefits. The benefits received by customers will determine customer loyalty. Perceived non-fulfillment of customer expectations after transaction will make customers disappointed and not repeating the transaction. The value the banks give to their customers has an indirect effect on customer loyalty. Customer perception of customer value or benefits for customers is not in accordance with customer expectations.

Loyalty could be built through increasing values (attribute value, consequence value and objective value) and satisfaction. Customer value is seen as customers’ feelings in response to their evaluation of banking services, while customer satisfaction is customers’ feelings of how each level of the values performs its functions in accordance with customers’ wishes. It is not sufficient for value-delivering banks to merely satisfy their customers, but they should also establish a long-term tie with their customers (Blut et al., 2007). Customer value is an emotional tie created between a customer and a bank after the customer has consumed the bank’s products or services and found that the relevant products or services provided value added (Spiteri and Dion, 2004). These authors defined customer value as a two-way communication between a customer and a bank in which the relationship is created after the customer has known and gave a positive evaluation of the products or services offered. This definition leads more to the relationship between customer value and customer loyalty. When customers perceive a product or service as capable of delivering added values and satisfying its customers, an emotional tie will be created between customers and the bank. This emotional relationship is referred to as customer loyalty to a bank.

It is common that banks want to retain their customers as long as possible. In the context of banking services, Lee et al. (2005) maintained that customer loyalty is customer commitment to a bank on the basis of a very positive attitude and is reflected in the consistent repeat purchases. Truly loyal customers are not only word-of-mouth advertisers, but they are also likely to be loyal to the portfolio of banking products and services for many years. When a customer is satisfied and loyal to a bank, then the relevant customer indirectly can serve as a means of free promotion for an extended period of time. Additionally, he or she will be the bank’s customer for a long duration of time that will ultimately benefit the bank.
Banks capable of understanding the problems faced by their customers and finding solutions to the problems do so by delivering values to their customers and building ties with them. Emotional ties formed will make the customers return when in need of banking services or recommend the bank to their friends and families. One of the best frequently recommended ways to achieve customer loyalty is to deliver values to customers (Chen and Hu, 2010). The Company must increase the value for its customers so that customers always faithful or loyal to the products and services company. (Wardana, 2015). Such a tie can be maintained by satisfying customers on an ongoing basis and building customer loyalty.

**Effect of Product Quality on Customer Loyalty**

Product quality has an insignificant effect on customer loyalty. An increasingly improved quality of a given product is not necessarily capable of making a customer loyal. It is due to the fact that customers will only deal with a bank on the basis of their levels of needs. Improving the quality of banking products does not automatically create loyal customers. Actually, state-owned banks have carried out massive innovations to banking products they offer. Those innovations have included, among others, ATMs that facilitate 24-hour transactions and convenience in withdrawal and deposition of funds at their branch offices on line. Wherever customers are located, customer banking activities continue as usual.

Another benefit that can be obtained by customers is competitive interests in which under the average competitive daily interest system customers have the opportunity to gain greater interests. Additionally, there are attractive prizes. Only by showing identity cards (ID card, driver’s license, passport, Temporary Entry Permit Card) anyone can become a bank customer. Nevertheless, an improved quality of a product does not necessarily make customers convinced, having an emotional tie with the bank and not moving to another bank.

Results of this study contradicted those of Bei and Chian (2001) and Lai et al., (2009). Product quality has a direct or indirect effect on customer loyalty mediated by customer satisfaction Bei and Chian (2001). Customer loyalty is caused by continuously accumulated effects of satisfaction or dissatisfaction in addition to product quality (Lai et. al., 2009). Results of this study showes that those theoretical and empirical studies stating and demonstrating a causal relationship of service quality with customer loyalty mediated by customer satisfaction can also be used to study the banking sector in Indonesia. Delivering the best quality product is a must for a bank. The better the quality of the products offered by a bank, the higher the customer satisfaction will be, thereby the higher the customer loyalty, as reflected by the increasing levels of customer trust to the bank. Banks are constantly committed to delivering quality products.

**Effects of Customer Satisfaction on Customer Loyalty**

Customer satisfaction has a significant effect on customer loyalty. The more satisfied the customers of state-owned banks (with service quality, bank’s image, customer value, quality of banking products), the more loyal the customers will be to bank’s products or services. Customer trust in a bank cannot be separated from the issues of satisfaction that can be fulfilled by delivering excellent service, good image and quality and valuable products to customers. Customer satisfaction constitutes the major prerequisite to explain customer loyalty. An increasingly fiercer bank competition in which more and more banks are involved in fulfilling customers’ needs and desires causes each bank to prioritize customer satisfaction.

The present study is supported by Blut et al. (2007); Hidayat (2009); Zafar et al. (2011); Chang et al. (2009); Liang and Wang (2004); Bei and Chiao (2001); Fullerton and Taylor (2002); Bell and Smalley (2005); Matos and Rosa (2009); Ndubisi et. al., (2008) and Ibáñez (2006). Customer loyalty is caused by continuously accumulated effects of satisfaction or dissatisfaction in addition to product quality. Loyalty will be created through habits and the long history of banking product consumption. Banks capable of satisfying their customers for a long duration of time will make their customers loyal and willing to repeat purchases (Blut et. al., 2007). There is a relationship of service quality and satisfaction with customer loyalty (Hidayat, 2009).

Customer satisfaction has a significant
effect on the desire to buy and that service quality has a small effect on repurchase compared with customer satisfaction. The present study demonstrated customer satisfaction has an effect on customer loyalty, which is defined as the desire to repurchase (Zafar et. al., 2011). Customer evaluates a banking product or service as capable of delivering added values to the customer, then he or she will be satisfied with the service or product offered. Such a condition would create an emotional relationship or tie between the customer and the bank. This is referred to as customer loyalty to a bank (Chang et. al., 2009).

Customer satisfaction is an evaluation of surprise inherent in or attached to the product acquisition and consumption experience. However, it should be kept in mind that the formation of customer expectations is influenced also by the previous purchase experience, friends’ and acquaintances’ comments and the promise of information from marketers and their competitors, as well (Liang and Wang, 2004). Customer satisfaction has an effect on customer loyalty (Bei and Chiao, 2001). Customer satisfaction has a significant effect in mediating the relationship between service quality and customer loyalty. Additionally, customer satisfaction significantly serves as the moderator for the effects in the relationship between service quality and customer loyalty (Fullerton and Taylor, 2002).

Customer satisfaction has a direct effect on customer loyalty (Bell and Smalley, 2005). Overall satisfaction has an effect on repurchase (Matos and Rosa, 2009). Satisfaction is a signal of the onset of true loyalty (Ndubisi et. al., 2008). Loyal customers are those so satisfied with a specific banking product that they have an enthusiasm to introduce the product to anyone they know (Ibáñez, 2006). Customers will repurchase a banking product they usually buy; even the customers will not use other banking products. The strengths and weaknesses of the bank will be informed to the bank. Moreover, the customer will share the bank’s excellence with others.

Conclusions

Theoretical findings of the present study that lead to the development of a theory are that customer value has an insignificant direct effect on customer loyalty. However, customer value had a significant effect on customer loyalty mediated by customer satisfaction. Product quality had a significant negative effect on customer loyalty. But, product quality has a significant positive effect on customer loyalty mediated by customer satisfaction. This study resulted in an integrated model of the relationships of service quality, bank’s image, customer value and product quality with customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Service quality service has both a direct and indirect effects on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Bank’s image has both a direct and indirect effects on customer satisfaction and customer loyalty. Service quality and bank’s image has the strongest and the most dominant effects on customer loyalty. Customers’ perceived service quality and bank’s image as reflected in their perceptions and expectations have both a direct and indirect effects on customer loyalty mediated by customer loyalty.

References


